

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

**IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD
ANTITRUST LITIGATION
(MDL No. 2406)**

Master File No. 2:13-CV-20000-RDP

This document relates to Provider-track cases.

**BLUES' SUBMISSION IN CONNECTION WITH PROVIDER PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION TO DISQUALIFY CYRIL SMITH AND FOR CORRECTIVE NOTICE**

The Blues respectfully make two points with respect to Subscriber class counsel Cyril Smith's solicitation of potential opt-outs from the pending Provider Settlement.

First, Mr. Smith's January 24 submission (Dkt. 3244) ignores his ongoing obligations to the Subscriber class. As the Blues have explained to the Court, the Provider Settlement very intentionally contains relief that is good for Providers and—importantly—good for members, *including the Subscribers Mr. Smith continues to represent*. (See Dkt. 3216 (Nov. 14, 2024 Provider Preliminary Approval Hearing Tr.) at 80:7-10.) For example, the Provider Settlement includes numerous improvements to the BlueCard Program that will increase Settlement Class Members' access to important member information, improve transparency with respect to member claims, and speed up resolution of member-claim issues. (See Dkt. 3192-02 (Provider Settlement Agreement) at ¶¶ 14-16, 18-20.) By disparaging the Provider Settlement and encouraging providers

to opt out, Mr. Smith is acting against the interests of his own Subscriber clients who will benefit from the Provider Settlement’s substantial injunctive relief.¹

Second, any representation by Mr. Smith of a provider opt-out (if permitted) would inevitably implicate his obligations under the MDL Protective Order (Dkt. 550). For more than a decade, Mr. Smith agreed to serve as a Court-appointed member of the Subscriber Plaintiffs’ Steering Committee and the Subscriber Settlement Committee (*see* Dkt. 61; Dkt. 62-1; Dkt. 82), and in that Subscriber capacity received the Blues’ (as well as Providers’ and numerous non-parties’) confidential information. The MDL Protective Order mandates that any information produced in the MDL “shall be used *solely* for the purpose of prosecuting or defending *this Proceeding* . . . and for no other purpose whatsoever”.² (Dkt. 550 at ¶ 2 (emphasis added).) It is implausible to assume that Mr. Smith will be able to cognitively suppress his knowledge of voluminous confidential MDL information while also zealously representing one or more provider opt-outs. Indeed, courts routinely recognize that “[i]t is very difficult for the human mind to compartmentalize and selectively suppress information once learned, no matter how well-intentioned the effort may be to do so.” *In re Deutsche Bank Trust Co. Americas*, 605 F.3d 1373, 1378 (Fed. Cir. 2010); *accord Fed. Trade Comm’n v. Advoc. Health Care Network*, 162 F. Supp. 3d 666, 670 (N.D. Ill. 2016) (“The inescapable reality is that once . . . a lawyer . . . learns the confidential information that is being sought, that individual

¹ At this stage, the Blues express no view on whether the Boies Schiller Flexner firm has a conflict in *A4* (*see* Dkt. 3243). That issue is not part of Providers’ motion and should not be answered on an advisory basis.

² This obligation, of course, survives the Subscriber Settlement and remains today. (*See* Dkt. 550 at ¶ 23 (“Any Confidential Material or any information contained in or derived from Confidential Material shall be subject to the provisions of this Protective Order until further Order of this court.”).)

cannot rid himself of the knowledge he has gained; he cannot perform a prefrontal lobotomy on himself[.]”); *Intel Corp. v. VIA Techs., Inc.*, 198 F.R.D. 525, 531 (N.D. Cal. 2000) (“good intentions are insufficient to prevent inadvertent disclosure of confidential information because it is not possible for counsel to ‘lock-up trade secrets in [her] mind’”); *Motorola, Inc. v. Interdigital Tech. Corp.*, No. CIV.A. 93-488-LON, 1994 WL 16189689, at *5 (D. Del. Dec. 19, 1994) (“The level of introspection that would be required is simply too much to expect, no matter how intelligent, dedicated, or ethical the . . . attorney[] may be.”).

Dated: January 31, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Karin A. DeMasi

Karin A. DeMasi

Lauren R. Kennedy

David H. Korn

Lillian S. Grossbard

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

Two Manhattan West

375 Ninth Avenue

New York, NY 10001

Tel: (212) 474-1000

Fax: (212) 474-3700

kdemasi@cravath.com

lkennedy@cravath.com

dkorn@cravath.com

lgrossbard@cravath.com

Lead Counsel for the Blue Cross Blue Shield System; Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross Blue Shield Association; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Alabama; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Arizona, Inc.; GuideWell Mutual Holding Corporation; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas City; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North Carolina; BlueCross BlueShield of South Carolina; BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.; Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wyoming; California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California; Capital Blue Cross; CareFirst Inc.; CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.; CareFirst BlueChoice, Inc.; Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii); Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for Montanans

Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa); Triple-S Management Corporation Triple-S Salud, Inc.

Craig A. Hoover
E. Desmond Hogan
Justin Bernick
Elizabeth Jose
W. David Maxwell
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
Columbia Square
555 13th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 637-5600
Fax: (202) 637-5910
craig.hoover@hoganlovells.com
desmond.hogan@hoganlovells.com
justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com
elizabeth.jose@hoganlovells.com
david.maxwell@hoganlovells.com

Counsel for Elevance Health f/k/a Anthem, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this action; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon

John D. Martin
Lucile H. Cohen
Travis A. Bustamante
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)
Mark M. Hogewood
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &
BRANDT, LLC
First Commercial Bank Building
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 870-0555
Fax: (205) 871-7534
kwest@wallacejordan.com
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross Blue Shield Association; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Arizona, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas City; BlueCross BlueShield of South Carolina; Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wyoming; Capital Blue Cross; CareFirst, Inc.; CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.; Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark Health; Highmark Inc., f/k/a Highmark Health Services; Highmark West Virginia Inc.; Highmark BCBSO Inc.; California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California; Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue

1320 Main Street, 17th Floor
Columbia, SC 29201
Tel: (803) 255-9421
Fax: (803) 256-7500
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Counsel for Elevance Health f/k/a Anthem, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this action; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Carolina; Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon; Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Mississippi, a Mutual Insurance Company; Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii); Triple-S Salud, Inc.; Defendants Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.

Cavender C. Kimble
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 1500
Birmingham, AL 35203-4642
Tel: (205) 226-3437
Fax: (205) 488-5860
ckimble@balch.com

Counsel for Elevance Health f/k/a Anthem, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this action; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North

Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii)

Carl S. Burkhalter
MAYNARD NEXSEN PC
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 2400
Regions Harbert Plaza
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 254-1000
Fax: (205) 254-1999
cburkhalter@maynardnexsen.com

Pamela B. Slate
HILL CARTER FRANCO COLE &
BLACK, P.C.
425 South Perry Street
Montgomery, AL 36104
Tel: (334) 834-7600
Fax: (334) 386-4381
pslate@hillhillcarter.com

With Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP, counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alabama

Helen E. Witt
Jeffrey J. Zeiger, P.C.

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
333 West Wolf Point Plaza
Chicago, IL 60654
Tel: (312) 862-2000
Fax: (312) 862-2200
jzeiger@kirkland.com
hwitt@kirkland.com

Counsel for Defendants Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of

Carolina; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon

Gwendolyn Payton
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND & STOCKTON
LLP
1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3700
Seattle, WA 98101
Tel: (206) 626-7714
Fax: (206) 299-0414
gpayton@kilpatricktownsend.com

*Counsel for Defendants Premiera Blue Cross,
d/b/a Premiera Blue Cross Blue Shield of
Alaska*

Brian K. Norman
SHAMOUN & NORMAN, LLP
1800 Valley View Lane, Suite 200
Farmers Branch, TX 75234
Tel: (214) 987-1745
Fax: (214) 521-9033
bkn@snlegal.com

H. James Koch
ARMBRECHT JACKSON LLP
RSA Tower, 27th Floor
11 North Water Street
Mobile, AL 36602
Tel: (251) 405-1300
Fax: (251) 432-6843
hjk@ajlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants CareFirst, Inc.;
CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group*

*New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield
of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and Blue
Shield of Montana; Caring for
Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark
Health; Highmark Inc., f/k/a Highmark
Health Services; Highmark West
Virginia Inc.; Highmark BCBSD Inc.;
Highmark Western and Northeastern
New York Inc.*

Jonathan M. Redgrave
REDGRAVE, LLP
4800 Westfields Blvd., Suite 250
Chantilly, VA 20151
Tel: (703) 592-1155
Fax: (612) 332-8915
jredgrave@redgravellp.com

*Additional Counsel for HCSC and
Highmark Defendants and California
Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of
California*

Todd M. Stenerson
Brian C. Hauser
ALLEN OVERY SHEARMAN
STERLING LLP
401 9th Street, N.W., Suite 800
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 508-8000
Fax: (202) 508-8100
todd.stenerson@aoshearman.com
brian.hauser@aoshearman.com

Rachel Mossman Zieminski
ALLEN OVERY SHEARMAN
STERLING LLP
2601 Olive Street, Suite 1700
Dallas, TX 75201
Tel: (214) 271-5777
Fax: (214) 271-5778
rachel.zieminski@aoshearman.com

Sarah L. Cylkowski

Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.;
CareFirst BlueChoice, Inc.

M. Patrick McDowell
Norman E. “Benje” Bailey, Jr.
BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER
& HEWES, PLLC
190 East Capitol Street
The Pinnacle Building, Suite 100
Jackson, MS 39201
Tel: (601) 948-3101
Fax: (601) 960-6902
pmcowell@brunini.com

Cheri D. Green
BLUE CROSS & BLUE SHIELD OF
MISSISSIPPI, A MUTUAL INSURANCE
COMPANY
P.O. Box 1043
Jackson, MS 39215
Tel: (601) 932-3704
cdgreen@bcbsms.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross & Blue
Shield of Mississippi, a Mutual Insurance
Company*

Alan D. Rutenberg
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP
3000 K Street, N.W., Suite 600
Washington, DC 20007
Tel: (202) 672-5491
arutenberg@foley.com

Diane R. Hazel
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP
1400 16th Street, Suite 200
Denver, CO 80202
Tel: (720) 437-2034
dhazel@foley.com

Ryan M. Hodinka
BALCH & BINGHAM, LLP
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 1500
Birmingham, AL 35203

Thomas J. Rheume, Jr.
BODMAN PLC
1901 Saint Antoine Street
6th Floor at Ford Field
Detroit, MI 48226
Tel: (313) 259-7777
Fax: (734) 930-2494
scylkowski@bodmanlaw.com
trheume@bodmanlaw.com

Andy P. Campbell
A. Todd Campbell
Yawanna N. McDonald
CAMPBELL PARTNERS LLC
505 North 20th Street, Suite 1600
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 224-0750
Fax: (205) 224-8622
andy@campbellpartnerslaw.com
todd@campbellpartnerslaw.com
yawanna@campbellpartnerslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Michigan; Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Vermont*

John DeQ. Briggs
Jeny M. Maier
Kenina J. Lee
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER,
LLP
1901 L Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036
Tel: (202) 912-4700
Fax: (202) 912-4701
jbriggs@axinn.com
jmaier@axinn.com
klee@axinn.com

Kail J. Jethmalani
Victoria J. Lu
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER
LLP
630 Fifth Avenue, 33rd Floor
New York, NY 10111
Tel: (212) 728-2200

Tel: (205) 226-3464
Fax: (205) 488-5848
rhodinka@balch.com

Counsel for Defendant US Able Mutual Insurance Company, d/b/a Arkansas Blue Cross and Blue Shield and as Blue Advantage Administrators of Arkansas

Robert R. Riley, Jr.
RILEY & JACKSON, P.C.
3530 Independence Drive
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 879-5000
Fax: (205) 879-5901
rob@rileyjacksonlaw.com

Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.

Edward S. Bloomberg
John G. Schmidt Jr.
Anna Mercado Clark
PHILLIPS LYTLE LLP
One Canalside
125 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14203-2887
Telephone No. (716) 847-8400
ebloomberg@phillipslytle.com
jschmidt@phillipslytle.com
aclark@phillipslytle.com

Morris Wade Richardson (ASB-8581-S78M)
Charles Todd Grimes (ASB-3224-S77C)
RICHARDSON CLEMENT PC
22 Inverness Center Parkway, Suite 500
Birmingham, AL 35242
Tel: (205) 729-7000
Fax: (205) 905-7009
wade@richardson.law
charley@richardson.law

Fax: (212) 728-2201
kjethmalani@axinn.com
vlu@axinn.com

Stephen A. Rowe (ASB-3804-E65S)
Aaron G. McLeod (ASB-8589-A57M)
ADAMS AND REESE LLP
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 3000
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 250-5080
Fax: (205) 250-5034
steve.rowe@arlaw.com
aaron.mcleod@arlaw.com

Counsel for Defendants Independence Hospital Indemnity Plan, Inc. f/k/a Independence Blue Cross; Independence Health Group, Inc.

Sarah Gilbert
Honor Costello
CROWELL & MORING LLP
Two Manhattan West
375 Ninth Ave.
New York, NY 10001
Tel: (212) 223-4000
Fax: (212) 223-4134
sgilbert@crowell.com
hcostello@crowell.com

Tracy A. Roman
CROWELL & MORING LLP
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 624-2500
Fax: (202) 628-5116
troman@crowell.com

John M. Johnson
Brian P. Kappel
Tatum L. Jackson
LIGHTFOOT FRANKLIN & WHITE
LLC
400 20th Street North
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 581-0716

*Attorneys for Defendant Excellus Health
Plan, Inc., d/b/a Excellus BlueCross
BlueShield*

Fax: (205) 581-9116
jjohnson@lightfootlaw.com
bkappel@lightfootlaw.com
tjackson@lightfootlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Nebraska; GoodLife
Partners, Inc.; Blue Cross of Idaho
Health Service, Inc.; Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Kansas, Inc.;
HealthyDakota Mutual Holdings; Blue
Cross Blue Shield of North Dakota*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 31, 2025, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Karin A. DeMasi
Karin A. DeMasi